

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

Certificate of Appropriateness
BZH-26826

Date: June 7, 2011

Proposal: Certificate of Appropriateness for a building addition and restoration of a contributing resource in the Harmon Place Historic District.

Applicant: Shea, Inc.

Address of Property: 1201 Hennepin Avenue

Project Name: Lund's Grocery Store

Contact Person and Phone: Gregory Houck, 612-339-2257

Planning Staff and Phone: Chris Vrchota, 612-673-5467

Date Application Deemed Complete: April 28, 2011

Publication Date: May 10, 2011

Public Hearing: June 7, 2011 (Continued from the May 17, 2011 meeting)

Appeal Period Expiration: June 17, 2011

Ward: Ward 7

Neighborhood Organization: Citizens for a Loring Park Community

Concurrent Review: N/A

Attachments: Attachment A: Materials submitted by CPED staff –

- 350' map (A-1)
- Harmon Place Historic District Map (A-2)

Attachment B: Materials submitted by Applicant –

- Notification letter to Council Member and neighborhood organization (B-1 – B-2)
- Application form (B-3 – B-4)
- Statement of Proposed Use / Project Description (B-5 – B-6)
- Applicants Findings Responses (B-7 – B-9)
- Plan drawings and specifications (B-10 – B-36)
- Additional Photos from Applicant (B-37 – B-55)

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division



Front of Subject Property- Present Day
Photo Submitted by Applicant

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

CLASSIFICATION:	
Local Historic District	Harmon Place Historic District
Period of Significance	1907-1930
Criteria of significance	Broad patterns of economic history (automotive industry in Minneapolis); Architecture
Date of local designation	2001
Applicable Design Guidelines	Harmon Place Historic District Design Guidelines, Secretary of Interior Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties

PROPERTY INFORMATION	
Current name	Billy Graham Evangelical Center
Historic Name	Reno Motor Company Building
Current Address	1201 Hennepin Avenue
Historic Address	1201 Hennepin Avenue
Original Construction Date	1912
Original Contractor	C.P. Johnson & Sons Co.
Original Architect	Long, Lamoreaux and Long
Historic Use	Commercial
Current Use	Commercial
Proposed Use	Commercial

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

BACKGROUND:

Constructed in 1912 on the corner of 12th Street South and Hennepin Avenue, the Reno Motor Company building is a three-story, flat-roofed concrete building clad in grayish-tan brick. One of the earliest automotive buildings remaining on Hennepin Avenue, this Long, Lamoreaux and Long designed building features a fine terra cotta cornice with paired brackets at the roofline, a terra cotta cornice between the first and second stories, and terra cotta molding around the windows on the upper floors. The building originally had stone storefronts at street level. The building housed a number of automobile showrooms before it was converted into offices in 1950 according to plans prepared by Liebenberg and Kaplan. The original windows of the 66'x 140' building have been filled in at the first story and altered at the second and third, but their original division is evident at the upper stories. Despite blocking of windows, much of the original Long, Lamoreaux and Long design is still intact.

In June of 2005, the Heritage Preservation Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of the subject property and the construction of an addition on the adjacent lot to the west to facilitate the conversion of the building to use as a grocery store. These approvals were never acted upon and have since expired.

SUMMARY OF APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL:

The Applicant is again proposing to rehabilitate the subject property, which is a contributing resource in the Harmon Place Historic District. Proposed restoration work on the original building includes installing new storefronts and windows where they have been previously in-filled on the first and second stories, re-installation of pre-cast concrete cladding, and cleaning of the original brickwork.

The Applicant is again proposing to construct an addition to the building on the surface parking lot on the adjacent parcel. The proposed one-story addition would measure *approximately* 79' wide by 138' deep, totaling 10,778 square feet. (Note- measurements are approximate, as addition is not an exact rectangle. Square footage provided by the Applicant.) While the parcel that the addition is proposed for is not located in the Harmon Place Historic District, review of the proposed addition falls under the purview of the Heritage Preservation Commission because it will be attached and require alterations to a contributing property in the district.

As part of the larger redevelopment of the site, the Applicant is also proposing alterations to the alley running along the south side of the site. They are proposing to remove the existing paving materials, including brick pavers that may be original to the district, and install a new paving surface. (The Applicant has proposed an asphalt alley. However, the Minneapolis Public Works department requires that concrete be used for alley construction.) A portion of the removed brick pavers would be re-installed at the two alley entrances. (See site plan on Appendix B-12.) The Applicant is proposing to use the remainder of the brick pavers as part of a rain garden on the property located at 1206 Harmon Place. 1206 Harmon Place is a separate Certificate of Appropriateness. Please see the HPC actions for 1206 Harmon Place for additional information on this proposal.

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

Please note that the plans do show signage on the building. The Applicant has not provided any additional details on proposed signage for the project (dimensions, materials, design, etc.) and has not finalized plans for signage with the property owner. In light of this, staff is recommending that no signage be approved as part of this Certificate of Appropriateness, and that a detailed signage proposal will be presented with applications for approval in the future, after details have been provided by the Applicant. (This includes the Lund's logos shown on the corners of the addition.)

Additionally, it should be noted that there are some differences in details between the actual plan sheets for the project (Appendix B-10- B-35) and the concept drawings provided by the Applicant (color renderings numbered page 1 and page 3). The review, analysis, and subsequent recommendation in this report are based solely on the plan drawings in Appendix B-10-B-35. The color renderings are assumed to be only for illustrative and conceptual purposes, and were not taken into consideration when reviewing the project and forming a recommendation.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment had been received by the time of publication.

CETIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: Certificate of Appropriateness for a building addition and restoration.

Findings as required by the Minneapolis Preservation Code:

The Planning Division of the Minneapolis Community Planning and Economic Development Department has analyzed the application based on the findings required by the Minneapolis Preservation Ordinance. Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings based upon, but not limited to, the following:

- (1) The alteration is compatible with and continues to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the landmark or historic district was designated.***

According to *The Harmon Place Historic District Final Report*, prepared by Landscape Research, the Harmon Place Historic District is locally significant for its depiction of auto-related commercial development and automotive architecture during the period 1907-1930.

The exterior portions of the building at 1201 Hennepin Avenue contribute to the district's significance. The Applicant is proposing to restore in-filled window openings on the first and second stories with new aluminum window systems. The windows would not be identical reproductions of the original windows on the building. However, they would fit within the original openings and be of a compatible style and design. (See historic photo in Appendix B-49 and elevation drawings in Appendix B-21-22 and B-27-28.) The proposed alterations would restore storefront windows along Hennepin Avenue and South 12th Street, replacing what is currently a solid wall and restoring interaction between pedestrians and users of the site. The proposed use, a Lund's grocery store, would return a commercial use to the site. The proposed window replacement would be compatible with and continue to support the criteria and period of significance for the district.

The proposed addition would mostly be in keeping with this finding. The one story addition would be constructed of primarily of red brick. The brick construction would be materially compatible with the original building and others in the district. The distinctly different color would help to identify it as a later addition to the building. The entrance along Hennepin Avenue would feature pre-cast concrete panels and a taller design with a cornice, which would help visually tie the addition back to the original building while also creating a transition between the three-story original building and one-story addition. The entrance in the addition would be separated from the original building by glass panels, which would create a visual break between the old and new construction.

The proposed brick corbelling at the corner of the north and west elevations, as well as below the windows on the west elevation, may not be fully compatible with the district. The corbelling, meant to be an architectural detail, may be too intricate to be fully

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

compatible with the Harmon Place Historic District, where substantial decorative brick treatments are generally not found on building walls. Earlier iterations of the design had the entrance located at the corner of the building, facing both Hennepin Avenue and the parking lot. While the design has been modified based on feedback from the City Planning Commission to locate an entrance mid-block along Hennepin Avenue, the new design does not hold the corner or finish the elevation as strongly as the previous design.

The addition is needed to provide sufficient area on the site for the operation of a grocery store. Bringing a commercial activity back to this site would help to support the criteria and period of significance for the district.

The proposed removal and re-use of paving material in the alley is an imperfect but acceptable solution. Ideally, the alley would be resurfaced using the existing paving bricks or with replacement bricks used where original material was not available or suitable for re-use. However, a brick paving system is likely not feasible for use in an alley that will see heavy traffic from both customers and larger, heavier delivery vehicles. Because the alley will provide the primary means of vehicular access to the site, it will be important for it to be kept free of snow in the winter, which can be difficult on an all-brick surface. Re-use of the original brick at the two ends of the alley will provide an interpretive element demonstrating the original appearance of the alley, which will be compatible with and support the criteria and period of significance.

(2) *The alteration is compatible with and supports the interior and/or exterior designation in which the property was designated.*

The proposed work can be done in a manner that will be compatible with and strengthen the elements of the property that make it a contributing resource in the Harmon Place historic district. This is accomplished by restoring previously in-filled storefront and second story windows, thus bringing the building closer to its original appearance.

The addition would be designed in a manner that is complimentary to the original building and other construction in the district without creating a false sense of history. The window bays are slightly larger than those on the historic portion of the building (1.5 feet wider and .5 feet taller), though the canvas awnings above the windows on the addition would soften this effect. Use of brick, concrete and glass as the primary construction materials are also complimentary to the district, where such materials are regularly found. The front wall of the addition would be built at the same location as the original building, reinforcing the street wall.

Restoration of windows in the original openings and conversion of the site into a functioning commercial space will help strengthen the building's ties to the commercial history of the district.

(3) *The alteration is compatible with and will ensure continued integrity of the landmark or historic district for which the district was designated.*

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

Both the City of Minneapolis' Heritage Preservation Regulations and the National Register of Historic Places identify integrity as the authenticity of historic properties and recognize seven aspects that define a property's integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. Based upon the evidence provided below, the proposed work would impact but not impair the integrity of the contributing resource.

Location: The Applicant is not proposing to change the contributing resource's location, thus the project will not impair the contributing resource's integrity of location.

Design: The Applicant is proposing to re-install storefronts and windows on the first floor and windows on the second floor where they had been previously in-filled. While the replacement storefronts and windows would not be re-creations of the original windows, they would be compatible with the building and other windows found within the district. The proposed windows would improve the integrity of design from the current painted infill panels on the first floor and blank infill panels on the second floor.

The proposed addition would impact the integrity of design- any addition will obviously impact the original design of the building. The addition would be on a secondary, albeit a highly visible elevation, due to the open surface parking lots on the adjacent properties. The addition is designed to be compatible with and complimentary to the historic construction of the district while being distinctly different so as to not appear historic itself.

Setting: The proposed addition is located primarily on a parcel that is not located within the Harmon Place Historic District, though it would be attached to a contributing building. The addition would replace a surface parking lot.

The most significant impact on setting would be through the proposed alterations to the alley. The alley is presently a mixture of paving bricks and asphalt patching. The proposed removal of the brick pavers would have an impact on the integrity of the setting for this property and other adjacent properties within the district. The proposed re-installation of bricks at the entrances to the alley would re-interpret this feature, but would not negate the impact on the integrity of setting.

Materials: The Applicant is proposing to remove non-original infill panels and restore aluminum and glass window systems on the first and second stories of the original building. This work will not result in the loss of any historic material from the building.

The proposed addition would be constructed of brick and pre-cast concrete, both of which can be found in the district and are permitted by the design guidelines.

As with setting, the biggest impact to the integrity of materials would come through the proposed removal of paving bricks in the alley adjacent to the site. As with setting, the proposed replacement and reinterpretation of the brick alley at the entrances would lessen but not fully negate the impact on the integrity of materials.

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

Workmanship: The Applicant is proposing to restore original window openings on the first and second stories of the building. This would result in the removal of non-original infill panels. No original ornamentation, such as the cornice, would be impacted through the proposed work. The work would not impair the contributing resource's integrity of workmanship.

Feeling: The proposed re-installation of windows on the first and second stories will help return the building to an appearance close to the original design. The new retail use of the site will help restore a commercial use to the site and the block face. The project will not impair the property's integrity of feeling.

Association: The project will not impair the property's integrity of association.

- (4) *The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission.***

The applicable design guidelines for this project are the Harmon Place Historic District Design Guidelines, which were adopted by the Heritage Preservation Commission in September of 2002. (Commissioners can find the guidelines on pages 5.2.1 - 5.2.18 of their Preservation Resource Binders.)

ORIGINAL BUILDING

Regarding windows, the Harmon Place Historic District Design Guidelines state: "b. Sash and Glazing: Historic wooden or metal sash should be conserved rather than replaced. If historic sash requires replacement, the size and number of panes of glass in each sash should not be altered. New sash, if installed, should duplicate the existing or other appropriate historic models, including the division of lights. Clear glass should be used unless historical documentation shows other treatments. Replacement windows may be wood or metal with a painted or baked enamel finish. The operation of replacements and the arrangement of lights should match the original. Crank-out units are not appropriate replacements for double-hung sash."

The proposed storefront windows on the first floors on the north and east elevations are clad aluminum frame systems with clear glass. The arrangement is three large windows filling the lower $\frac{3}{4}$ of the openings, with six smaller windows above. (See elevation drawings in Appendix B-21-22 and B-27-28.) This arrangement does not duplicate the original storefront window arrangement on the subject building, but is compatible with the design and with other historic models. The proposed windows on the second story of the north and east elevations are clad aluminum windows with a low-e glazing. Two windows would replace the existing infill panels, with the four existing smaller windows in each bay would remain. The proposed design of the windows would be in keeping with the design guidelines. The proposed use of non-clear glass would not be in keeping with the design guidelines. (The Applicant has provided material samples for the clear and low-e coated glass, as well as the window cladding, pre-cast material on the addition and awnings on the addition, all of which will be available at the public hearing.)

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

ADDITION

Regarding building additions, the Harmon Place Historic District Design Guidelines state:
“7. New Construction and Additions:

- a. New buildings and additions in the Harmon Place Historic District should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings and the pedestrian-oriented streetscape.
- b. New buildings and additions should relate to the scale, size, height, massing and materials of existing historic buildings. Acceptable materials include stone, brick, rusticated concrete block and decorative terra cotta. Synthetic stucco, including EIFS, should not be used.
- c. New buildings and additions should relate to the placement and orientation of adjacent historic buildings. In most cases, new buildings should be built to the lot line to create a continuous street wall.
- d. Facades should maintain the traditional division of an articulated storefront or entry-level story, an upper facade with regularly-spaced windows, and a well-demarcated roofline. Roofs should be flat with appropriately detailed parapets and/or cornices.
- e. Windows, entries, and storefronts should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings in their alignment, type and proportion. Features such as divided lights, transoms, signbands, and bulkheads are typical of many storefronts and should be included in new design where appropriate.
- f. Additions to existing historic buildings should not replicate the original but should be designed as a new structure that is compatible with the scale, height, massing, materials and details of the original building.”

The addition is designed at a scale and using materials that are compatible with the original building and other buildings in the district. The front wall of the addition would be built to the lot line like the original building, reinforcing the street wall. The addition places an entrance on Hennepin Avenue, directly addressing the pedestrian-oriented streetscape. The front of the addition features storefront bays with large, regularly spaced windows. The flat roof is demarcated by a simple evergreen band of metal coping. Finally, the addition is compatible with the original building and others within the district without replicating the historic structures. The brick and pre-cast concrete are materially compatible with other construction in the district, while the color and size of the windows and design of the building identify it as a modern addition. The proposed addition is in keeping with the Harmon Place Historic District Design Guidelines.

The Harmon Place Historic District Design Guidelines do not establish guidelines for the treatment of alleys within the district.

- (5) ***The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the recommendations contained in The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.***

The Guidelines for windows in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are most applicable to the proposed project.

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

ORIGINAL BUILDING

In regard to design for missing windows, the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation recommend: "Designing and installing new windows when the historic windows (frames, sash and glazing) are completely missing. The replacement windows may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the window openings and the historic character of the building."

The Applicant is proposing to install new windows on the first and second stories of the north and east elevations. These windows are not accurate restorations of the original windows on the building, but are compatible with the window openings and the historic character of the building, which is in keeping with this guideline.

ADDITION

Regarding new additions to historic properties, the Guidelines for Rehabilitation recommend: "Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Considering the design for an attached exterior addition in terms of its relationship to the historic building as well as the historic district or neighborhood. Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color," and "Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building."

The proposed addition is on a non-character defining elevation. It is designed in a manner that references design motifs from the original, as demonstrated by the pre-cast concrete entry area and large storefront windows, while being clearly identifiable as a modern addition. The proposed addition is in keeping with these guidelines and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- (6) ***The certificate of appropriateness conforms to all applicable regulations of this preservation ordinance and is consistent with the applicable policies of the comprehensive plan and applicable preservation policies in small area plans adopted by the city council.***

The proposed alterations are considered a major alteration and require a Certificate of Appropriateness application.

As conditioned, the project would comply policy 8.1.1 of The Minneapolis Plan, which states: "Protect historic resources from modifications that are not sensitive to their historic significance." Conformance with this policy is demonstrated by the project being in keeping with the applicable design guidelines and portions of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

The proposed redevelopment of the site into a grocery store will also help meet policy 4.14, which states: "Encourage recruitment and retention of retailers in Downtown that fill a functional need for office workers and residents." The addition of a grocery store to this

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

area will provide an asset to both residents in the adjacent neighborhood as well as employees of downtown businesses who drive through the area on their ways to and from work.

Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings that alterations are proposed in a manner that demonstrates that the applicant has made adequate consideration of the following documents and regulations:

- (7) *Adequate consideration of the description and statement of significance in the original nomination upon which designation of the landmark or historic district was based.***

The Applicant submitted a document addressing the 12 required findings (see Appendix B-7 – B-9). The Applicant believes that the proposed project will strengthen the integrity and significance of the building by restoring the principle façade along Hennepin Avenue and increasing awareness of the historic district.

- (8) *Where applicable, Adequate consideration of Title 20 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances, Zoning Code, Chapter 530, Site Plan Review.***

The proposed exterior changes to the building will require site plan review. The Applicant is working with CPED Development Services staff and will be pursuing required approvals of the City Planning Commission concurrent with the Certificate of Appropriateness process.

- (9) *The typology of treatments delineated in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the associated guidelines for preserving, rehabilitating, reconstructing, and restoring historic buildings.***

The proposed work falls under the scope of rehabilitation. The proposed work would be in compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The Applicant stated generally that they believe the proposal is in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, but did not specifically address any of the Standards or Guidelines.

Before approving a certificate of appropriateness that involves alterations to a property within an historic district, the commission shall make findings based upon, but not limited to, the following:

- (10) *The alteration is compatible with and will ensure continued significance and integrity of all contributing properties in the historic district based on the period of significance for which the district was designated.***

The proposed changes would restore original window openings that have been in-filled, bringing the property closer to its original design and appearance. The proposed addition is designed in a manner that is compatible with the historic building and others within the

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Planning Division

district. The one-story design with large storefront windows is compatible with this district, designated for its representation of early automotive oriented architecture. The Nash building at 8 South 13th Street S, Motor Car Equipment Company building at 1213 Harmon Place, and Oscar M. Nelson Company building at 1315 Harmon Place are all examples of single-story buildings with large front display windows that date from the district's period of significance. The alterations would be compatible with and will ensure the continued significance and integrity of all contributing properties in the historic district based on the period of significance for which the district was designated.

(11) *Granting the certificate of appropriateness will be in keeping with the spirit and intent of the ordinance and will not negatively alter the essential character of the historic district.*

The spirit and intent of the City of Minneapolis' Heritage Preservation Regulations is to preserve historically significant buildings, structures, sites, objects, districts, and cultural landscapes of the community while permitting appropriate changes to be made to these properties. The Applicant is proposing to restore previously in-filled windows while also constructing an addition that will allow the building to be put to a commercial use once more. As conditioned, the project complies with the Harmon Place Historic District Guidelines and Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, and would not negatively alter the essential character of the historic district.

(12) *The certificate of appropriateness will not be injurious to the significance and integrity of other resources in the historic district and will not impede the normal and orderly preservation of surrounding resources as allowed by regulations in the preservation ordinance.*

The proposed rehabilitation of the original historic building would have a net positive impact on the significance and integrity of the district. Re-investment in this property and bringing a strong commercial tenant to this busy intersection may help spur further reinvestment in the district, furthering the preservation of the remaining resources.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

CPED-Planning staff recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission **adopt** staff findings and **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness for a building addition and restoration with the following condition(s):

1. CPED-Planning reviews and approves final site plan, floor plans, and elevations.
2. No signage is approved. All signage shall require additional applications and approvals.
3. Glazing for all street-level windows shall be clear, un-tinted, non-reflective glass. Low-e coating may be used on glazing above the first story.
4. For patching in areas where mechanical equipment is to be removed on the original building, replacement brick must match the original in size, shape, color and composition. Staff shall approve final replacement brick material.
5. Any paving brick not being salvaged for re-use within the project shall be returned to the City of Minneapolis Public Works Department.
6. All workmanship must be completed in conformance with the Secretary of Interior Standards, see: <http://www.nps.gov/history/hps/tps/standguide/>
7. The Applicant shall obtain all other necessary City approvals prior to the commencement of work.
8. Alley design and construction shall meet the requirements of the Minneapolis Public Works department.
9. The Certificate of Appropriateness approvals shall expire if not acted upon within one year of approval, unless extended by the Planning Director in writing prior to the one-year anniversary date of the approvals.

Attachment A: Submitted by CPED staff

Attachment B: Materials submitted by Applicant